

Name:

Source:

Herodotus on Otanes and democracy (3, 80-82, adapted)

When the uprising was lessened in violence, and five days had passed, the rebels against the Magians held a council on the whole state of affairs, at which they said these words, which to some Greeks seem incredible; but there is no doubt that they were spoken. Otanes supported that the government should be assigned to the whole body of the Persian people. "I hold," he said, "that we must make an end of monarchy; there is no pleasure or advantage in it. You have seen to what lengths went the rude behavior of Cambyses, and you have borne your share of the rude behavior of the Magians. (...) But the virtue of a multitude's rule lies first in its excellent name, which signifies equality before the law; and secondly, in that its acts are not the acts of the monarch. All offices are assigned by lot, and the holders are responsible for what they do; and the general assembly judges and decides on all counsels. Therefore I declare my opinion, that we make an end of monarchy and increase the power of the multitude, seeing that all good lies in the many."

Such was the judgement of Otanes; but Megabyzus' counsel was to make a ruling oligarchy. "I agree," said he, "to all that Otanes says against the rule of one; but when he bids you give the power to the multitude, his judgement is not the best. (...)"

Darius was the third to declare his opinion. "According to me," he said, "Megabyzus speaks rightly concerning democracy, but not so concerning oligarchy. (...) I hold that monarchy is by far the most excellent. Nothing can be found better than the rule of the one best man;"

<http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/hopper/text?doc=Hdt.%203.80&lang=original>

Question: Which main democratic value is presented by Otanes through Herodotus in the text above? Which are Megabyzus' doubts?

Name:

Source:

1. Otanes' counsel	
Direct Speech	Indirect Speech
"I hold," he said, "that we must make an end of monarchy; there is no pleasure or advantage in it. You have seen to what lengths went the insolence of Cambyses, and you have borne your share of the insolence of the Magian."	
Students' counsel	
Direct Speech	Indirect Speech

2. Otanes' counsel	
Direct Speech	Indirect Speech
He said "But the virtue of a multitude's rule lies first in its excellent name, which signifies equality before the law; and secondly, in that its acts are not the acts of the monarch."	
Students' counsel	
Direct Speech	Indirect Speech

Name:

Source:

--	--

3. Otanes' counsel	
Direct Speech	Indirect Speech
He said: "All offices are assigned by lot, and the holders are accountable for what they do therein; and the general assembly arbitrates on all counsels."	
Students' counsel	
Direct Speech	Indirect Speech

4. Otanes' oration	
Direct Speech	Indirect Speech
He said, "Therefore I declare my opinion, that we make an end of monarchy and increase the power of the multitude, seeing that all good lies in the many."	
Students' counsel	
Direct Speech	Indirect Speech

Name:

Source:

--	--

5. Megabyzus' oration

Direct Speech	Indirect Speech
"I agree," said he, "to all that Otanes says against the rule of one; but when he bids you give the power to the multitude, his judgment falls short of the best. (...)"	
Students' counsel	
Direct Speech	Indirect Speech

6. Darius' counsel

Direct Speech	Indirect Speech
"According to me," said he, "Megabyzus speaks rightly concerning democracy, but not so concerning oligarchy. (...) I hold that monarchy is by far the most excellent. Nothing can be found better than the rule of the one best man;"	
Students' counsel	
Direct Speech	Indirect Speech

Name:

Source:

--	--